Revitalizing Movements in Developmental Change*

BRYCE RYAN!

Less developed societies throughout much of the world have undergone or are in the throes of collective social movements expressing their unrest, xenophobia, and vaguely articulated aspirations. Many of these movements are tenuously related to the specific requirements or goals of modernization. They involve peoples questing for modernity while acting to revivify some ancient legendary past or seeking, perhaps passively, an emotionally satisfying future state which may or may not be rationally pursued or be even remotely realistic. Many are vague as to what lies beyond national or ethnic autonomy: still others seek secular reforms through methods and leaders legitimated by sacred tradition or by supernatural sanction. Some pursue magically a utopian dream world.

In this strange potpourri of collective actions one finds a secularly guided Buddhist "reformation" in South Asia which is more mediaeval than modernizing in aim, while in Africa prophetic millenarian movements are instruments in the creation of modern political states. Vinoba Bhave can press a secular land reform program in India through the re-affirmation of guru worship, much as Gandhi acted toward national autonomy for a secular state in his role as saint and associated it with almost primitivist concepts of the future economy. In contemporary Korea, a major industrialization program proceeds with startling success under the mobilizing powers of charismatic leadership and a dream of the millennium. Long established Muslim institutions in North Africa have been challenged by reformists who would "out-traditionalize" the traditionalists as they modernize both religious and secular ideologies and structures. In most of Africa south of the Sahara syncretically rooted movements offer millenarian, nativistic utopias with a bonus in faith healing and collective ecstasies. In Melanesia the cargo cults continue to appear, as do similar movements in the circum-Carribean region and elsewhere.

^{*} This article was published in German in the Kölner Zeitschrift für Soziologie und Sozial psychologie, 13th special issue, Opladen 1970. We thank the publishers of this issue for permiting us to reproduce the original English version: Editors' Note.

^{† 1} am indebted to my colleague Dr. Aaron Lipman for his critical comments on this manuscript.

This wealth of revitalizing, expressionistic cults and movements in developing countries is not without interesting parallel in the development of Europe and North America. It is possible that some major comparative analysis would find a universal patterning in movement types as associated with different "stages" of development. In any event it is probable that much the same array of movements as shown today in the "Third World" was evidenced in the West. Worsley (1968, p. 227) has observed that whereas "Marx described the agrarian history of the Roman Empire as its 'secret history', the secret history of the Middle Ages is the history of Millenarian and allied sects, a history only now being written." For America it is notable that "The Great Awakening' reached a crescendo in 1740, and while the accumulation of worldly goods was a latent consequence of Puritan self-realization, the support for American nationalism was loud and clear. The millenium was indeed to come—and in the American colonies, (Heimert).

It is perhaps ironic that in the "Third World", struggling toward rational social organization and technology, so many forces should be marshalled around expressionist cults, prophetism, millenarianism and traditionalism. Yet, modernization does not descend as some substitute world imposed through rational, goal oriented and individualized decision making. Innovations are always filtered by traditional beliefs however revolutionary they may become in their ultimate effects. Dissatisfactions and associated innovative wants which are closely related to the moral fabric of society most acutely require reconciliation with tradition. Even when the past does not legitimate the future, it colours the perceptions of what the future should be and how it is to be reached. Most secularly inspired movements take pains to reconcile their goals to some traditional values, or at least devise plausible theories as to the spuriousness of those values. Although movements which revitalize through messianic and millenarian orientations represent breaks with tradition, they stand for still sharper breaks with the status quo. Charismatic leaders "repudiate the past" in the sense of being unbound by established rules and norms, but they are not without historical sensitivity when they define their people's destiny, (Gifford).

In many "Third World" situations an existing social structure is less traditional than it is representative of the exploitative ends of an indigenous or colonial establishment. Here the power of a greater traditionalism as a movement basis is usually supported by nativism, populism and xenophobia. Although messianic movements involve calculated ruptures of tradition, they do so within the larger process of reconstituting primordial bonds. Serious polarization between messianism and traditionalism may be inevitable, however, as political interests develop. Thus in situations such as that in Ghana, those who held the vision of the new society came into overt conflict with upholders of the colonial and feudal past. Forced choices rather than reconciliatory gestures were demanded

(Apter, 1965, Ch. 3, 1966). Ultimately the seriously dysfunctional traditions must be drastically modified. Since every society possesses such a wide range of traditional truths, it is always possible to find ancient bases for reconciling an immense range of innovation—unless, as for Nkrumah, a traditionalist opposition is polarized and adamantly organized.

It is understandable that societies in which the world view has been more supernaturally directed than that of Western society should also invoke the legitimating powers of religion and the supernatural. These are frequently—perhaps always in contemporary developing societies syncretically fused with messianic and apocalyptic concepts in Christianity and, to some extent, in Islam. The expressionistic satisfactions found in charismatic relationships, and in ecstasies, and the emotional joys in miracles of faith-healing are powerful sources of enthusiasm regardless of the social direction toward which the movement may direct itself. Indeed social goals may not even be apparent. Enthusiasm is the first crucial ingredient in revitalizing movements. Collectivity goals in contrast to individualized or competitive ones demand that the participants be galvanized into unity. Under conditions of supernatural orientation wherein societal goals and ideologies can be but loosely and vaguely formulated, enthusiasm can readily rest on religiously induced rapport. As R. A. Knox has observed rather elliptically in regard to the Anabaptists, Latter Day Saints and others. "....in times of social unrest, otherwordliness is tempted to fish in troubled waters...." (Knox p. 585). Yet, escapism and expressionism should not be permitted to obscure social significance in the movements which dignify such rewards for participation.

Social movements are a principal vehicle through which the valued traditions and solidarities of the society are fused with the prerequisites of modernization. This is not to say that social movements invariably act toward developmental change but rather that developmental change cannot proceed without an enthusiastic marshalling of a collective support possible only through the formation of movements. Rational technological devices may be spread through the calm and calculated processes of diffusion. New structural equilibria may be sought in the deliberations of social planners, but rapid transformations in total community or societal institutional structure come only out of the cumulative interaction of unrestful people who generate the vehicle, as well as the goals, of change as they move along. When dissatisfactions touch central institutional values, collective actions toward change supersede distributive ones.

The professed goals of movements at any stage may or may not correspond to their functional consequences. Generally the sociology of social movements has been more concerned with the internal structure of

movements and their individual, psychological functions than with their societal functions. Such an approach to millenarian movements, has, for example, brought to them a simplistic explanation in terms of quest for salvation, with personal escape through expressionistic satisfactions. Much theory of millenary movements seems to apply more to their psychological and theological roots than to their functional significance. In fact the eminent historian of medieval millenarianism, Norman Cohn, seems deliberately to reject social functional analysis— "as one is impelled, rather, to consider the psychic prerequisites for these movements" (Cohn, 1962, p. 42). To be sure, firm answers to this position will be found in the respective works of Schlosser, Balandier, Bastide, Guiart, Hobsbawm, Worsley and others. However the latter group's more sociological views were not much evidenced in the conference of millenarian scholars brought together in 1960, in which Cohn's position is asserted (Thrupp, ed.).

It is perfectly reasonable that historians and psychological sociologists should be concerned with the situational press out of which movements arise as well as the psychological satisfactions derived from participation in them. But to deny the validity of the search for social evolutionary significance in movements turns personal predilection into scientific soothsaying. Distributive change in the sense of diffusion of cultural innovations among individuals is a much simpler orientation to the study of social change. So also is the equilibrium-disequilibrium model in the functional analysis of change. Perhaps it has been the relative simplicity of these approaches which seduced the American sociology of change from interactional and historical orientations. But the fact remains, that the massive transformations in societies are typically attended by the cumulative interaction of disquieted people seeking, through collective action, a structure for the expression of shared dissatisfactions, and in this process asserting something about the direction of evolutionary change. In this context, "development" and "modernization" become the popular catch-words for what was "evolution" and "progress" at the turn of the century.

A social movement is conceived here as an emotionally concerned collectivity undergoing increasing formalization in structure at it moves toward some common goal. This concept would exclude purely expressive and transitory groups, such as those in sporadic dancing manias, unless these develop some structure and persistence in time. However, persisting but *purely* expressive groups would not be considered movements. Where a separatist group engages strictly in actions of self-realization and emotional release they are better understood as cults than as movements. Cults are frequently forced to come to terms with the community and so lose their "pure" status. Many separatist and expressionistic collectivities develop into social movements (e.g. Methodism) as instrumental and societal goals are articulated and internal structure is generated. Social

movements arise in collective unrests and emotional interactions and so long as a movement *moves* it must have emotion as a binding and mobilizing agent. Without enthusiasm there is no movement; nor is there one without a posture in reference to the larger society.

Social movements imply a dynamic process of internal growth through the interaction of participants and leaders and the interaction of both with the public, "The Establishment," and counter-movements. They evolve from an emotionally affiliated collectivity toward an increasingly structured organization. Leader-follower relationships typically shift from the charismatic to the bureaucratic. With increasing social orientation and rationality the expressionistic qualities of the movement usually diminish. As a movement becomes an institution, "converts," "followers," and "adherents," become simply "members." Where a movement is not separatist, it may die with success, as did the Womans Suffrage Movement or, through failure in social objectives it may wither away, or retrench its social goals and revert to an expressionistic cult.

The present paper is concerned most explicitly with a range of movements which have been termed "revitalistic" (Wallace). Revitalization movements seek to activate a people toward broad transformations in the social fabric. They are expressionistic in their appeals and in their participant satisfactions. Manifestly they pursue goals which may or may not be directly germane to modernization but which are contrary to the status quo. Although the complexity of social movements, with their chameleon-like capacity for re-orientation, have largely defeated classificatory attempts, the nature of revitalization is best shown through certain movement types. We are dealing here with movements of the order of cargo-cults, millenarianism, prophet and messianic movements, traditionally oriented movements of nativism and revival. These various categories of movement all connote feverish enthusiasm associated with what are broadly religious feelings in the pursuit of collective goals which would transform the status quo if they are achieved. The religious component often includes conversion in its literal sense, magical and supernatural techniques and gratifications, and either religious or traditional legitimation of goals or both. Cargo cults have widely appeared in Melanesia, with closely similar phenomena in other world regions, as native peoples collectively prepare for the ship (or air-ship) which will bring them the white man's goods and his productive magic. Millenarian movements range from passive preparation for a heavenly world to come to the active construction of earthly utopias, often in preparation for a time of supernatural perfection. Prophet and messianic movements involve supernaturally legitimated leadership toward goals which may be millenarian. Although the past is fulfilled through messiahs, the emotional power of their movements are enhanced by the very breaking of traditional taboos (Worsley, 1968, p. 250). Nativistic movements act toward the revivification of primordial, usually ethnic bonds, often with xenophobic

themes. Revivalist movements awaken collective concern with traditional institutions toward reinstating values which appear threatened in the existing state of affairs. It is evident that these various movement types do not usually exist in pure form. Cargo cults involve "prophetic leadership" and nativism, nativistic movements not only stir the fire of "nationalism" but also extell the greatness of ancient institutions, etc. Many years ago Ralph Linton offered a typology of nativistic movements which has since undergone substantial critical review. It is useful, however, to recognize that active nativistic movements may pursue the magical revival of the ancestral world or may pursue what Voget terms "reformative nativism," which assumes a critical appraisal of the past.

While we may create a typology of movements for heuristic purposes, such classificatory devices involve the dominance of one feature compared to others. Revitalization movements partake in varying degrees of several or even all of these movement types. Practically all movements of this general class have religious or magical elements and some degree of traditionalism, and a strong component of expressive satisfactions. Their societal goals, when formulated, generally include the usual connotations of social reform; but also go considerably beyond these connotations.

There are many studies of the conditions under which revitalization movements have arisen in particular regions. This is especially true of millenarianism. Attempts to deal with revitalization as a generic phenomenon are fewer, although a wealth of monographic data, historical, psychological, ethnographic and sociological material has been accumulated. Outstanding analyses have been done for the Melanesian cargo cults, medieval millenarianism, African prophet movements and American Indian movements such as the Ghost Dance, peyotism, and Handsome Lake's reformatory revitalization. Considerable attention has also been focussed on the syncretic, counter-acculteration movements in Middle America, millenarianism in Brazil and Indonesia, as well as a wide range of revivals in various locales. Additionally there are strong but unstudied revitalization themes in reform and revival movements in South Asia and such secular revolutionary movements as witnessed in contemporary China. Revolutions are frequently revitalizing movements with the special sense that they are first of all "power control" directed. They often pertain to utopian goals sought through groups which are expressionistic and perhaps messianically inspired. Although the introduction of historical European movements is enticing, attention is here directed to contemporary "non-Western" societies moving into that confused stream of events known as "development" or "modernization."

The present paper has arbitrarily disregarded the Red Guards and similar political power control movements as well as the quasi-social movements which Hobsbawm has termed "social banditry."

Conditions Underlying Revitalization Movements in Developing Societies

Considerable theorizing has been done regarding the conditions stimulating or "causing" revitalizing movements, especially those of millenarian style. Except for a few works like V. Lanternari's Religions of the oppressed, most causal theorizing has pertained to particular species of movements in similar cultural contexts. The emphasis upon causal factors usually depends upon the academic orientation of the research scholar. Something like a cross section of points of view on the roots of millenarian movements is found in the Thrupp symposium. Thrupp concludes (pp. 25-27) that of all explanatory theories presented, that of deprivation in its various guises was the most forceful. Other explanations presented there included a universal propensity to suffer distress and anxiety, the powerful aesthetic attraction of movement imagery, and response to tensions arising between formal leaders and a set of rivals. In general, these explanations were not mutually exclusive or particularistic. The approaches were more historical and psychological than situationally oriented. In the Thrupp symposium, Norman Cohn continues to prefer to translate situational forces into psychological terms (Cf. Cohn, 1957, pp. 307-314). He does not pursue his earlier use of concepts like "mass paranoia" but he continues to support the view that mediaeval millenarian movements were pathological and fanatical side-shows, while wholly unrelated movements pursued the true social reforms.

As one surveys a range of movements, histories and generalizations from a sociological standpoint, there appear to be at least four types of conditions which stimulate and activate revitalizing movements. All seem to be present in situations giving rise to revitalizing movements in the developing countries. These are: (1) The pre-existence of an extensive "moral order" associated with a magical world view and frequently with Dionysian themes which are intensified by ecstatic versions of Christianity; (2) Acculturative contact with the forces of "developed," usually "Western," societies creating pressures for modernization while adversely affecting the integrity of traditional institutions; (3) Social tensions arising from oppression, exploitation and deprivation at the hands of an indigenous or alien elite, usually associated with acculturation forces; (4) Dissatisfactions arising from (2) and (3) above are diffuse in the sense of affecting a wide range of life situations, both expressionistic and instrumental.

(1) The pre-existence of an extensive "moral order" associated with a magical world view and Dionysian themes.

Practically by definition societies entering the developmental race have a more encompassing moral or sacred order than has the secular West. Revealed truth and the authority of tradition are generally more powerful than in Western society and feelings of a broadly religious nature infuse into a wider range of actions. In the absence of a dynamic, scientific technology, traditional societies have been more deeply concerned with the technology of magic. Sharp distinctions are often not drawn between the realms of the supernatural and the natural. Revitalization movements draw upon religious and sacred sentiments of many sorts; some of them frankly favour the revival of supernaturally sanctioned, as well as traditional, symbols. Virtually all involve some degree of mysticism and generate exhilaration which is religious intone even if not supernaturally directed. Prophets and messiahs are publicly defined in terms of superhuman power and prowess. These ingredients of revitalization are also present in developed societies but usually in attentuated and more restricted forms.

Although chiliastic Christianity has been influential syncretically in many of these societies, there is substantial basis for believing that revitalization themes are frequently consistent with indigenous beliefs and practices.

A peyote cult, for example, was observed in Mexico as early as 1560, (Lanternari pp. 67-68). Ribeiro (pp. 55-58) notes that mass migrations of the Tupi-Guarani in Brazil toward the "Land Without Evil" occurred under religious inspiration even before European contacts. Van der Kroef finds deep cultural roots underlying the messianic upheavals in Indonesia in the early decades of this century. Cosmic regeneration with the return of the dead was a fundamental theme in Melanesian religion, (Eliade). The ubiquitous prophet movements in modern Africa are so strongly supported by indigenous cultures that Herskovits argued that they are merely reinterpretations of movements prevalent before European contact (Fernandez pp. 533-534; Cf. Andersson, chapter 13). Although India has been singularly lacking in millenarian movements, mass religious excitement with spirit possessed leaders is surely not new. In all of these regions, ancient cultural themes provided ready ingredients to be fused with diffusing ideologies and sparked by acculturation and oppressive tensions.

(2) Acculturative contact with "developed" societies

As we view the sudden spurts toward modernization, it is easy to forget that, for four centuries in much of the undeveloped world, the xenophobic embers have been glowing and indigenous institutions responding to "Western" culture contact. Although the acculturative influences were usually associated with oppressive and exploitative ones as well, the social response to threatened cultural integrity is somewhat different from response to social domination and exploitation. The first is more conducive to traditional revivalism, the second to nativism and xenophobia. Often these responses can be merged within a single revitalizing movement.

The white man's religion threatens the sacred institutions as well as the indigenous elites having vested interests in them. A money economy, and instrumentalism with reference to nature and one's fellow men are upsetting to sacred ecological systems as well as to status reciprocates. As the encroaching acculturative patterns extend into the sacred fabric of institutions, they also hold the tantalizing promise of great rewards.² These are evident in the material amenities available only through a money economy. Still greater promises are made of a glorious society to come through the blessings of Christianity. In some places such as India, the humane values of the Western tradition made a strong impact on an intelligentsia. When implied or explicit promises are weakly fulfilled, feelings of relative deprivation (and hostility) arise with reference to actual contrasts and with reference to images of the future, and of the past as well (Aberle). Even the native intellectual finding joy in Western humanism comes up short before the rigorous colonial administration and missionary dogmatism. Except perhaps in rare places like Hawaii where missionaries settled into the role of indigenous benevolent despots, the white man ultimately was found to have been "speaking with a forked tongue."

J. Guiart (p. 229), writing with reference to cargo cults, has observed that the "common element is a lack of balance in the actual native society, the traditional frame having been undermined or destroyed, through the failure of administrators or missionary methods or even simply through depopulation...." Belshaw has referred to the "half-way millennarian" whose dual problem is to explain European success and then to achieve a method to parallel it. In South America, the source of acculturative and especially exploitative tensions has been an indigenous elite. The problem for the peasant or Indian is little different here, except that the indigenous oligarchy has even deeper interests in a repressive status quo than does a colonial administration.

Not least among relevant acculturative consequences is the deteriorating effect upon traditional sources of emotional and expressive satisfaction. Fernandez attaches considerable importance to this factor in relation to the rise of prophet movements in Africa and it seems probable that the weakening of traditional mechanisms of emotional self expression have widely supported the growth of exhilarating movements, particularly as these can be charismatically directed toward instrumental goals, many of which also carry strong emotional tones.

If acculturation threatens much it also promises much, but the fulfilment of promise has rarely occurred before the threat to cultural survival and social integrity became evident. In her study of the Ghost Dance,

In some regions acculturative pressures were not induced by Western societies. Xenophobic and traditionalist elements in the Korean Park Chang No Kyo movement are
responding to Japanese domination while the religious ideology is a derivation of Presbyterianism, (Cf. Moos.).

Cora Dubois concludes that movements of this order arise when tradition has been eroded but while *faith* in tradition is still strong. It is noteworthy too that missionaries, while a major force in discrediting tradition, have commonly intensified the social technology of revitalization movements. Acculturative contacts yielded an evident threat to native institutions while intensifying crucial mechanisms for movements in their support, e.g. messianism, millenarianism, and perhaps even religious militancy.

(3) Social tensions arising from oppression, exploitation and deprivation at the hands of an indigenous or an exotic elite.

There are few "Third World" instances in which the troubled operations of traditional institutions cannot with some accuracy be attributed to outsiders. While there are cases, as in West Africa (Plotnicov) and in Korea (Moos) where the chief villains were non-Westerners, mainly the responsible parties have been associated with colonial powers or with indigenous elites identified with Western culture. The threat and promise inherent in acculturative relationships has typically occurred in conjunction with white or at least "whiter" domination, which at its worst has been forthrightly oppressive and at minimum, condescending and paternalistic. Specific, rational reform movements by natives, where they arose, were rendered ineffective by the colonial powers. Thus when early African moderate reform movements and associations began to appear, a governor of Rhodesia could direct that leaders of such movements should be ridiculed and treated as "errant children" (Rotberg). Widely, the colonial and quasi-colonial elites approximated true caste status in both their structural relationship to "natives" and in their reconciliatory ideologies. Missionaries preached brotherhood while maintaining rigid social segregation. Brutally exploitative and even exterminative policies were not uncommon. With few exceptions, the modern world of amenities was physically evident but the routes to its achievement either blocked or taught unintelligibly while the unfilled promises of acculturative contact were dramatically exemplified by the elite. Beyond absolute and relative physical deprivation, even human dignity and pride of culture were denied to the masses. Hostility was added to frustration. Whereas simple deprivation and the disorganization of valued institutions may lead to diffuse anxiety and perhaps apathy, the domination-exploitation patterns associated with irregular acculturation focuses and personalizes these ills. In some instances, particularly in South America, feelings of oppression have long smouldered more or less removed from concern over the decay of some traditional social order. Elsewhere the decay of traditional institutions has been attributed to European domination without much feeling of instrumental deprivation but with hostilities associated with the decline of indigenous institutions. An example of this is in the Buddhist revival movement in Ceylon where mildly xenophobic themes had less to do with oppression or instrumental deprivation than with what was in recent centuries a covert repression of Buddhism under Western rule,

(Smith, 1966). It was further charged that the indigenous Westernized elite succeeding the colonial administration was little more concerned with traditional institutions than had been the British.

It is difficult to conceive of a revitalization movement which is fully supportive of The Establishment. Such movements are concerned with major reconstructions in the social order rather than with patching up the status quo. The designation of an elite as the effective cause of social ills is a catalyzing perception. Under simple acculturative deprivation this perception may be slow in appearing. Under acculturative deprivation and oppression the personal agency is made evident and diffuse feelings of dissatisfaction can be given an emotional focus. Guilt for the existing state of affairs is assignable to a culturally distinct elite. With such focus, nativistic and xenophobic themes in revitalization are practically assured.

The slowness with which many revitalizing movements take on xenophobia is surprising. A critical factor activating this powerful stimulant has been the unreasoned and often violent suppression of messianic and mainly expressionistic cults, by colonial authorities. Suppressive measures, especially in the punishment of prophetic leaders, seem to have brought the dissatisfying truths home to native peoples and so added the invigoration of hate to revitalizing movements. The attribution of evil to those who maintain the status quo sometimes extends to fantastic, but nonetheless socially effective, lengths. In Melanesia it was alleged that missionaries tore the first pages from Bibles to prevent full knowledge from coming into native hands (Worsley, 1968, p. 43). The writer has heard sophisticated South Asians contend that their countrymen studying in English universities had certain critical demonstrations withheld from them.

(4) Dissatisfactions arising from (2) and (3) above are diffuse in the sense of affecting a wide range of life situations, both expressionistic and instrumental.

Chalmers Johnson has observed that revolutions are generated under conditions of diverse and extensive dysfunctions adversely affecting many spheres of life. The same condition probably applies to revitalization movements generally. All signify the broad reconstruction of the social order and imply the immediate or eventual overthrow of an established power elite. (Revolutions are revitalization movements in which the legitimacy of the elite is denied and violence has been added.) It is doubtful if very broad social reconstruction is seriously pursued except as the pains of deprivation and of resentment extend into a considerable range of life activities. Deprivation can exist in any aspect of life and be relative to imaginary ideals as well as to actual contemporary contrasts. That such extensions occur is inevitable once collective unrest arises. It is a major function of movement leadership to expand the range of perceived

dissatisfactions. Glorious histories can be imagined on the theory that the invader never existed. The actual depth of wounds matters less than this extensiveness of hurt and the increasing conviction that there is a potential world in which such ills need not exist. When these perceptions can be supported by a personalized, emotional focus of blame based on oppression and deprivation, movements gain momentum. Needless to say, the generation of charismatic leadership is crucial if collective unrests are to be transformed into revitalizing movements, (Cf. Gifford).

The Functions of Revitalization Movements

We must reject Norman Cohn's intimation (1960) that the search for the role of millenarian movements in the evolutionary process is a fruitless undertaking, in contrast to the search for their psychic prerequisites. While the historian may decline such theorizing, the sociologist has some obligation to accept the responsibility. And if mediaeval millenarian movements were indeed unproductive of long range change, we cannot reach similar conclusions regarding similar movements in the contemporary developing world. There are undoubtedly circumstances where such movements, like anarchists or Anabaptists, "though not unarmed, did not know what to do with their arms, and were defeated for ever." (Hobsbawm, p. 92). But there is solid evidence that cargo movements in Melanesia, prophet movements in Africa, and certainly widespread nativistic reformative movements, have had substantial effects on the course of colonial and post-colonial history. It must be confessed that there are circumstances when the escapist and expressionist aspects of movements drain and redirect energies from tangible social goals. But more typically the expressionist movements are generated in circumstances wherein pragmatic reform movements are incapable of forming, or require the emotional power derived from convergent revitalization. Such circumstances may arise due to the suppression or ineffectiveness of rational reform actions or in states of "pre-political" organization wherein sophistication in the rational techniques of unity and the exercise of pressure are lacking.

Millenarianism, and revivalism superficially appear to be dysfunctional from the standpoint of modernization. Even movements of reformation frequently profess to seek the re-establishment of a still "more traditional" tradition than that which is currently in vogue. Often in the seeking they also utilize and reaffirm non-rational bases for action. It cannot be argued that the manifest goals of cargo cults, peyote cults and chiliastic Christian sects are functionally positive from the standpoint of developmental change. Many of the movements considered here are not directed toward the resolution of realistic problems in the pathway of modernization; and as has been suggested, some may actually drain efforts from potential or existing rationally directed programs. However, the fact that manifest goals are "unrealistic," or that personal rewards

for participation are expressionistic, does not have much to do with the latent functions of such movements. Whatever else revitalization movements may or may not do they shake up The Establishment by calling the status quo into question. Even successful revival movements attempting outright reinstatement of tradition eventually threaten their own leadership when those leaders find themselves forced to make terms with the exigencies of real twentieth century situations.

The case of the Colombian Violencia is interesting in this connection although it ends, as of this time, in something of an anti-climax. For a generation Colombia has been involved in a massive unrest known as the Violencia. The Violence had no manifest goal to pursue and was not a social movement so much as a massive, endemic expression of hostility arising out of the brutal suppression of a liberal political movement. Although the liberal movement disintegrated, the repressiveness practiced by the conservative, established elite resulted in widespread violence on such a scale that unknown thousands of persons were butchered by their neighbours, bands of brigands killed victims without regard for their politics, and thousands of families fled their homes for somewhat greater safety in the vast unsettled regions of the country. Soon removed from political goals and social reform or even controversy, the unrest became a "conflict of annihilation." Concerning this period. Orlando Fals-Borda wrote that "it doesn't appear to be a jump to the opposite pole of secularism. Instead, it is a conglomeration of conflicting values juxtaposed and fused to the point of being contradictory and confusing." But in this anomic, goalless struggle, Fals-Borda concluded that bases were being laid for new institutions. Goalless massacres, and banditry, with a vast uprooted population, forced the oligarchy to face up to some facts of life in the twentieth century. We may not conclude that the Violencia was an efficient or a rational modernizing movement. It was anything but this. But it so shook a national social structure and an oligarchy so concerned with its twentieth century image, that the developmental consequences have been positive.

The Violencia is perhaps the "limiting case," since it was manifestly a collective emotional horror, not a revitalizing movement. In the range of true social movements as considered here, there are more specific and tangible latent functions played by movements which, in the beginning

^{3.} The political appeals of the late S. W. R. D. Bandaranaike in Ceylon were more traditional and restorative than reformative and he was swept into power by a movement of ethnic and religious revivalism. His election owed greatly to the support of the Buddhist monks and the ayurvedic medical practioners (traditional herbalists in distinction from "Western" medical practioners). Although Bandaranaike's traditionalistic goals wavered little, the facts are that modern health conditions required a strong Western medicine and that modern governmental bureaucracy did not merge readily with historical concepts of Buddhist clerical autonomy and a "state religion." Bandaranaike was assassinated by a disillusioned follower who was both an ayurvedic physician and a Buddhist monk.

at least, are unrelated, tangential, or even contrary, to requirements of modernization. At least four types of consequences may be distinguished which are potentially functional for modernization and development.

Direct, social reform goals are frequently attached to movements which are generated on expressionistic satisfactions and messianic or utopian visions.

Millenarian movements such as Park Chang No Kyo are expressive, and utopian but their emotionalism is geared to secular expression and their millenarianism is more Zionistic than chiliastic (Moos). Not only has the Park Chang No Kyo produced large and prospering industrial communities, it is providing Koreans with a more reliable and mobilizing interpretation of the Protestant ethic than Presbyterian missionaries have been able to do. Similarly inspired movements culminated in economically progressive utopian communities in the Western world and have left some heritage of economic rationality albeit in the midst of religious conservatism.

Millenarian themes have been vitalizing forces in many separatist movements which addressed themselves to the preliminary task of building a communal life consistent with messianic revelation. In contrast with chiliastic and apocalyptic sects, these might well be distinguished as movements of "messianic social reconstruction."

The distinction between reform movements and those of social reconstruction is of course a matter of degree. Frequently, social reforms are pressed as campaigns within deeper movements in which utopian dreams are pursued. Thus Vinoba Bhave can lead a neo-Gandhian movement toward an ideal state—rather like one envisioned by philosophical anarchists—but he also leads an affiliated action movement toward the immediate secular end of land redistribution (Koestler; Bondurant and Fisher).

Still different reformative actions are derived from movements which are immediately directed to the effective reinterpretation of tradition and sacred teachings. Diffuse neo-traditionalist movements frequently are associated or merged with movements which use the fervour of revitalization to accomplish specific structural reforms consistent with the broad ideological goals. Modernizing effects from such sources are evidenced in the Islamic reform programs in North Africa, and in some nativistic movements south of the Sahara. They were evident earlier in movements such as the Arya-Samaj in India. It is notable that in the Islamic reform movements the rejection of established Sufi power, much as in the anti-Brahmanical Hindu movements, is activated through recourse to sacred teachings more sacred and more fundamental than those supporting the status quo and its religious elite. The restoration of supernaturally and traditionally sanctified principles of social order is an effective route

to rational reform and modernization. Traditions need not die with modernization. Revitalizing movements selectively redefine them and utilize them as constructive forces for developmental change. Voget has shown that nativistic movements among American Indians have similarly yielded a new life meaning and self-realization through critical reflection on the past. Ultimately every traditionalistic and nativistic movement must, if it achieves greater than a temporary or a cult significance, come to terms with current realities and so justify Voget's designation, reformative nativism.

Reform functions adhere to general revitalization movements in differing relationships while deriving emotional and ideological nourishment from the broader movement. In some circumstances the relationship between revitalization and specific action-reform goals is sequential rather than parallel. This is particularly true of movements with highly expressionistic appeals and pragmatically unrealistic images of the future. Such movements may arise as cults and after a stage of popular excitement subside into cults again. On the other hand they may grow into expressionistic movements which set the stage and give thrust to "realistic" reform programs. The direction of such transformations are dependent upon a complex balancing of situational factors, including increased sophistication in the rational techniques of social power, fluctuations in the repressiveness of the established authority and the fortunes of available leadership. It is not argued that chiliastic movements usually turn toward rational reform, but rather that it is unjustified to dismiss them as being typically abortive from the standpoint of evolutionary change.

Worsley (1968) has observed that millenarian and secular movements of protest can coexist or that either one may precede or follow the other, but as the dominant form of protest, millenarianism always gives way to secularized forms. It remains a matter of interpretation as to the genetic connections between millenarian cults and movements and secular reform programs spawned in their wake. No doubt the greatest contribution of the cult which matures into an expressionistic movement is in the realm of social solidarity and ethnic dignity. However, there are striking examples of the direct application of highly expressionistic millenarian movements to explicit action programs. Such a relationship was evidenced in the Kimbangist movement of the Congo wherein this messianic movement lent its force to the Bakongo nationalist party in an open political alliance, (Michael Baton, cited by Worsley, 1968, p. xlvii). Where formal affiliations are not made, the political leaders must take into account the power of the messianic movements, (Balandier, ch. 7). In the Massinga Rule Movement (Marching Rule) in the Solomon Islands in 1945 a cargo-cult-movement rapidly matured into an organized and disciplined political mass movement which was to become a force in governance and development—despite, or perhaps because of, repressive and punitive police actions, (Worsley, 1968, ch. ix).

Revivalist movements do not always reveal their functional potentials while at their most feverish pitch. The recent (i.e. 1956) Sinhalese revivalistic and nativistic movement, as well as Buddhist revivals in Burma, were manifestly negative from the standpoint of rational social development (Smith, 1965). In the Sinhalese case, skilled political leadership coupled nativist pride in the restoration of their Buddhist civilization with the activation of hostilities toward a Hindu Tamil minority. Bandaranaike came to power upon a program which had little to do with basic developmental issues or reforms. His policies of Sinhalese domination caused massive riots which, coupled with priorities given to the Sinhalese language and religion, brought the country to the margins of economic chaos. Yet despite all this, the movement exposed the crucial need in this developmentally apathetic situation for modernizing reforms in the organizational structure and ideological emphasis of Sinhalese Buddhism. Hopefully, in the creation of Buddhist universities as part of a manifestly dysfunctional nativism, potential intellectual vehicles for modernization were created. These institutions will require an intellectual leadership which may find the fuller truth of the teachings in a greater emphasis on the positive values of secular life (Rahula, chapter 8).

2. Revitalization movements are organizational and mobilizing sources for ethnic dignity, solidarity, and the rise of nationalistic and "pan-" movements.

Each major region in the "Third World" has known a variety of movements which have functioned to retrieve ethnic dignity in the face of social denigration and acculturative threats. Even in the Melanesian cargo cults with their emphasis upon material goods, Kenelm Burridge has made clear the fact that the precious cargo had deeper symbolic significance than utilitarian. The crux of the matter was the search for dignity, and in these movements came organizational structure toward that quest and a renewed ethnic identity. The cargo movements were organized thrusts toward national self-consciousness. Worsley and Guiart have found these movements to be the "forerunners" of nationalism and significant pressures toward true national development. Through time cult expressionism is divorced increasingly from secular reform programs. However this does not deny the mobilizing functions of the movements as lines are drawn between the exploiter and exploited, hopes generated, and solidarity and confidence intensified by the opposition measures of colonial authorities. In some regions, cargo movements receded into passivity, but elsewhere their thrust and organization were transformed into potent political-economical movements. Marching Rule became in fact a political party and the Paliau Movement among the Manus was a political and economic action movement which grew in the soil fertilized by cargo dreams, xenophobia, and emotional contagion (Worsley, 1968, pp. 182-194).

If cargo cults are no more than "proto-nationalistic", many African prophet movements are literally the embryonic phases of nationalism and continue as energizing sources for political movements which have become parties and governments.

There has been some controversy over whether the African religious movements were more political than religious. In terms of societal function, the political consequences are surely more significant, since the ecstasies of religion have been synthesized with secular political ends. While this has been more obvious for the non-separatist and millenarian "political religions", the separatist sects have also contributed to anticolonial sentiment, nativism, and nationalism. The separatists are revisionary sects, "Africanizing" the major Protestant denominations. The millenarians have been prophetically led and loosely organized movements emphasizing the "Black Saviour" and the "Black Jerusalem". These movements were given immense stimulation by the American exports of apocalyptic Christianity, especially through the Salvation Army and Jehovah's Witnesses (The Watchtower Movement), and to some extent by the American Negro's search for the golden age, in Africa. Christianity in Africa has been transposed through messianic nativism from its concept of individual salvation to one of "We" rather than "I" (Bastide 1966, pp. 469-470).

Rotberg has concluded that African religious movements have made a major contribution to nationalism through the revival of African self-respect. The prophets and their followers asserted the conflicts of interest in the colonial context: They defined alternatives to submission to white power. They glorified that which was African while Africanizing those diffusing values which they also glorified. The movements did more than establish a trend and platform for nationalism. They were in the life stream of the rising political states. No fine distinctions were to exist between "church and state". Political religions bloomed into political states which, if not theocratic, elevated the secular to the level of the sacred (Apter, p. 73). That this was no forced marriage is illustrated by James Fernandez's conversation with a backbush cult leader who explained that "politics is a way of searching for God, and religion is the way of worshipping Him once you have found Him" (p. 532).

In North Africa the early religious purification movement was the core for the nationalistic neo-Salafiyya reform movement. Nationalistic political ends were clothed in the garments of religion (von Grunebaum). It is interesting although not surprising to recall that an earlier puritan movement in the American colonies served similar functions. Among American Indians, there came close on the heels of the Ghost Dance, a number of highly expressionistic cult-movements which were to revive ethnic self-esteem to the point of a "chosen people" concept (Voget). Voget notes that more acculturated Indians even argued for autonomous Indian States.

Although some movements referred to here have been called "tribal millenarianism," they have stimulated "pan-Africanism," "pan-American Indianism" and have had similar effects among the segmented societies of Melanesia and elsewhere. In America, the roots from which the Ghost Dance arose gave birth subsequently to pan-Indian movements which have persisted into contemporary times. Only one of the great revitalizing movements, Gaiwiio, has not spread widely. Shakerism diffused extensively through the West while peyotism united peoples from the Southwest through the Great Plains and beyond. Voget considers the universalistic quality of such movements, now become churches, to be producing a nationalistic Pan-Indianism which holds the beginning of a Great Awakening.

South of the Sahara, pan-Africanism was explicit half a century or more ago in the Watchtower movement as well as in Marcus Garvey's essentially secular "Universal Negro Improvement Association," and in the Ngunzism Prophet Movement, (Andersson, pp. 250-257). Since 1945 pan-Africanism has become a potent part of African development under the leadership of such political religionists as Nkrumah (Worsley, 1968, pp. 88-92). Political religion is equally complicated in North Africa, where religious movements are both nationalistic and super-nationalistic, (Brown; von Grunebaum; Abun-Nasr). The political differentiation of the Arabs is a product of European influence and conservative Muslims can view it as the worst of Western gifts. Religious revitalization movements in this milieu face the difficult problem of reconciliation between existing national states and a tradition-supported, pan-Arab, Islamic super-state.

3. Revitalization movements are syncretistic and ultimately accommodative, adapting the diffusing symbols, norms and organizational patterns of developed societies into movement structure, tactics, and goals.

Although revitalization is not by definition syncretic, practically all such movements in developing countries are so in fact. Some represent syncretisms to the extent of developing quite novel institutions, such as the "Roman" Catholicism of Mayan Indians or the "Protestantism" in Bantu separatist churches (Edmonson et al; Sundkler). Other movements are frankly accommodative, emphasizing those traditional values which are consistent with Western achievement and progress orientations. Still others simply adopt modern technology and organization methods in furtherance of their own power and their objectives. Rarely do even extremely traditionalistic or utopian movements shun the mass media and bureaucratic structures for furthering their causes, just as secular reforms are pressed by movements utilizing revelation, supernaturalism and legend as instruments to some phase of modernization.⁴

^{4.} The almost millenarian movement led by Vinoba Bhave offers an interesting exception. Leaders of this movement toward a casteless, classless and stateless society refuse to use the machinery of government to attain even immediate goals (Smith, 1966 a, p. 34; Bondurant and Fisher).

At the level of norms and values, the impact of Western society shows up in practically all movements emphasizing reform in traditional ways. For example, Western humanism and socialism have been powerful resources in the revitalizing reformation movements in Hinduism, bringing to it greater emphasis upon values of achievement and equalization of human worth. In these, much as in Salafiyya movements in Islam, modernization is sought by out-traditionalizing the traditionalists although this more ancient tradition is usually one closely tailored to the specifications of an achieving, and socialistic society. As yet similar reformation movements in Theravada Buddhism have not been much in evidence. In both Cevlon and Burma gestures have been made toward modernization and there are learned monks, particularly in Ceylon, who seek, for example, the reconciliation, or perhaps, syncretization of Buddhism and Marxism. (Smith, 1965; 1966^a, pp. 21-48; Bonn). But the significant fact is that in all of these countries "the new interpreters of religion have generally assumed the basic validity of the imported Western ideas" (Smith, 1966, p. 36). Theravada Buddhism appears to struggle rather chaotically in regard to which values will be reconciled and through what kinds of organizational devices. Yet it is clear that development will not occur associated with mediaeval Buddhism, and it certainly will not be achieved without Buddhism at all (Smith, 1965; 1966, chap. 1.2, 21, 22; Wilson; Siriwardane).

In Africa, where the culture base provided no great literary traditions comparable to those in Islamic, Hindu and Theravada civilizations, there has been more creativity in distinctive syncretic institutions. Over 2,000 separatist Bantu churches were listed in 1960 (Sundkler p. 374). While it is obvious that Christian eschatology offered excellent material for absorption into the emergent nativistic religions, there has also been substantial normative accommodation through these vehicles. Sundkler (p. 307) has noted that until 1945 the prophetic theme in South Africa was a protest against the missions, the Land Act, and the cultural patterns of whites in education and preservation of life. After 1945-1948 there was a notable shift toward accommodation even in this situation dominated by apartheid. This accommodation is particularly evident in business enterprise, education and health care. Sundkler writes that:

In Zululand, therefore, certain prophets allow their people to visit the hospitals—whether run by missions or by the Government—to be operated on and to receive medical treatment—a course hitherto regarded by the Zionists as a mortal sin. When the patient is about to be discharged as healed, the prophet and his helpers arrive at the exit of the hospital in order to counteract the effect of the medical care... Among the student nurses, a certain number are now daughters of Zionist preachers, and these told me with a smile that 'doctors and nurses have the spirit of Christ', (Sundkler p. 309-310).

These highly syncretic and nativistic religious movements are taking a lead in agricultural development programs and their church colonies are enterprising and energetic centers of commerce. Sundkler (p. 307) observes that there is a "modern Nguni parallel to the combination of Methodist revival and business enterprise in eighteenth-century England". In regard to a different African context, McKim Marriott (p. 496) has noted cryptically that in the wardrobes of Kwame Nkrumah and Sir Abubakar Balewa is a mixture of tribal robes and business suits.

Baeta's studies of prophetic, "spiritual churches" in Ghana indicate the revival of traditional moral injunctions consistent with the modernization of life and the inhibition of dysfunctional or inconsistent norms. To expect these heretical, magical and literalist sects to move directly and manifestly in support of a rational, secular society, would be unreasonable, but as Baeta observes, group aspirations are reflected in the selectivity of practices, and the aspirations of the people are more complicated than a simple desire to return to the past.

It is relevant that in 1945-46 Sundkler (p. 302) considered the Bantu Separatist Church to be a "bridge to the religion of the past, a bridge leading people back to 'African spiritism'." But fifteen years later he was to qualify:

In the city, with its rapidly industrialized civilization they [the churches] functioned as 'adaptive structures'. In Zululand and Swaziland they were, relatively speaking, bridging the difficult transition period from traditional religion to new structures and a new ideology (p. 302).

The syncretic structures in which Christianity merges with indigenous concepts and rituals may of course offer no more than individual, expressionistic satisfactions. However, as cults mature into prophetic movements they must develop organizational rationality. Also, they become sensitive to the larger social context. This is the more rapid where repressive actions are taken by the established authorities, a condition which has generally been the case. There is persistent pressure for the inwardly directed cult-movement to take on complex structural forms and to develop an accommodative stance for survival in the community. To do this, modern forms of social organization are essential. Fernandez has observed, for example, how rationality in organization became essential for the viability of African prophet movements as agencies of national integration despite the strains which arise between the rational and expressive elements. Modern organizational forms are diffused and syncretized no less than are the rituals and symbols of Christianity.

Nowhere have the rational bureaucratic forms of social organization been more slavishly and meaninglessly adopted than in the Melanesian cargo cults. European structures were caricatured in fine detail from the hierarchy and red tape of colonial government to the organization of cricket teams. Particular stress was laid upon military drills, registers and signal codes. All this was done as part of the imitative magic which would bring the millenium. But if cricket clubs did not play cricket they provided an organizational structure for conflict with colonial authorities. And if make-believe "Executive Officers" and "Home Secretaries" did not have magical effect upon the cargo to come, they were elemental gestures toward the rational devices of social power. Whatever the remoteness of the manifest ends to which these organizations were applied, they were nonetheless introductory to the social devices essential for unification and the organized conflicts which were to follow.

Where acculturative and other processes have undermined primordial group structures, revitalizing movements also create voluntary associations to take on functions no longer adequately performed by traditional groups. No one could suggest that it was a manifest and fundamental goal of African separatist churches to fill the void left by disorganized traditional groups. However, not only have the new African churches taken a "Western" denominational form, they have come to perform aid and welfare functions which traditional groups are incapable of performing. The provision of expressionist functions has been remarked upon earlier. The continued vigour of American Indian revitalization movements in a secular environment lies in their adoption of modern church structure, even to the organization of missionary programs and fraternal auxiliaries (Voget). Even in the Sinhalese Buddhist revival, traditionalism did not retard such organizational devices as the Young Mens' Buddhist Association, obviously derived from Christian sources (Ames). Nor were the Buddhist universities modelled on archaic principles. They are firmly built upon the pattern of the modern Western university.

CONCLUSION

The contemporary sociology of development, particularly in America, has not paid sufficient attention to the interactional processes through which social transformations occur. There has been an emphasis upon polar societal types, and other structural, equilibrium models. While these orientations, as well as studies of the diffusion and the integration of cultural innovations are useful for the sociology of change, they do not incorporate the recognition that change actually arises in the social interaction consequent upon valuations of the status quo or some aspect of it. Social movements provide a major organizational frame within which collective interaction occurs with reference to some image of the future. In the interactive processes of social—particularly revitalizing movements, traditions are collectively melded, or reconciled, or rejected with reference to the attainment of idealized objectives. These objectives are qualified and redefined in response to situational realities and the confrontations which a rising movement must face. Revitalization movements are expressionistic collective actions toward major social

reconstruction, often of a utopian nature. In developing societies it is their central function to provide the organizational vehicle through which broad dissatisfactions with a status quo are articulated and mobilization facilitated toward major changes in the social order. Theoretically, revitalization movements are of two types, the one finding its legitimation and goals in the revival of tradition, the other through a concept of destiny, and revelation. Yet both types serve to invigorate primordial bonds, and movements of destiny do not necessarily require a break with *all* tradition.

There should be nothing surprising in the fact that revitalizing movements usually begin with an emphasis upon expressionistic satisfactions and vague or pragmatically unrealistic social goals, if indeed these exist, in their early stages. Such movements arise from circumstances of diffuse dissatisfactions under conditions of oppression, denigration, and deprivation. In most "Third World" regions, these conditions have been exacerbated by acculturative threat to valued institutions. The emotional satisfaction of incipient movements, sometimes more accurately termed "cults", or even "social contagions," bind followers to a collectivity capable of generating intelligible images of the future which serve further to solidify the collectivity as well as to activate it. It is improbable that revitalizing movements can develop without charismatic leaders to unite collective unrest with faith in the achievement of a better future. It is universally true of social movements that goals are unceasingly in formulation along with increasing structuralization.

Complex circumstantial and cultural factors may press an incipient revitalization movement toward emphasis on one or more of several themes. Such variables include pre-existing cultural patterns, exposure to Christian or Islamic messianism, and repressiveness of the established elite. Some movements, e.g. cargo-cults, are perhaps more "primitive" than others since they imply a pre-political society with minimal exposure to a scientific "world view."

There has been controversy as to the evolutionary or developmental significance of revitalization movements, especially those of millenarian character. Evidence precludes an unqualified judgement. It is possible that some movements of this type have drawn off energies which *might* have been expended in direct action programs. However, it is a thesis of this essay that very widely throughout the "Third World", movements which are superficially expressionistic, "escapist", and/or "traditionalistic" are serving positive, developmental functions. These functions are typically latent ones and are not always readily identifiable in the movement goals. They are certainly not to be confused with the individualistic and expressionistic functions which are also provided. Revitalizing movements arise as the aggrieved are unified by a sense of exhilaration and hope for the future. This hope, however realistic or unrealistic in the eyes of the outside observer, virtually requires the confrontation of

an awakening mass with the maintainers of the status quo. Under some conditions even a challenge is a major step. Segmentalized "pre-political" societies are moved toward integration and national consciousness. Frequently, specific reform or revolutionary actions are combined with either traditionalistic or millennial orientations. And as developing movements must face the public, the Establishment, and counter-movements, they adopt forms of rational organization and tactics which are consistent with modernization. Where expressionistic movements do not make the transition into secular reform or revolutionary movements, they may relapse into passive cults—but cults which have fertilized the soil of discontent and planted therein seeds of unity, organization and hope.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Aberle, David F., "A Note on Relative Deprivation Theory As Applied to Millenarian and Cult Movements," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor) Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Abun-Nasr, J., "The Salafiyya Movement in Morocco: The Religious Bases of the Moroccan Nationalist Movement," in *Social Change: The Colonial Situation*, Edited by Immanuel Wallerstein, John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1966.
- Ames, Michael, "Ideological and Social Change in Ceylon," *Human Organization*, Vol. 22, 1964, pp. 45-55.
- Andersson, Efraim, Messianic Popular Movements in the Lower Congo, Uppsala, 1958.
- Apter, David E., "Political Religion in the New Nations," in Old Societies and New States, edited by Clifford Geertz, Free Press of Glencoe, New York, 1963.
- Apter, David E., The Politics of Modernization, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1966.
- Apter, David E., "The Role of Traditionalism in the Political Modernization of Ghana and Uganda," in *Political Development and Social Change*, edited by Jason L. Finkle and Richard W. Gables, John Wiley and Sons, Inc., New York, 1966.
- Baeta, C. G., Prophetism in Ghana: A Study of Some Spiritual Churches, London, SCM Press Ltd., 1962.
- Balandier, Georges, Afrique Ambigue, Librairie plon, Paris, 1957.
- Barber, Bernard, "Acculturation and Messianic Movements," American Sociological Review, Vol. 6, No. 5, 1941, pp. 663-669.
- Bastide, Roger, "Le Messianisme Rate," Archive Sociol. Relig., Vol. 5, 1958, Jan-June, pp. 31-37.
- Bastide, R. "Messianism and Social and Economic Development," in *Social Change: The Colonial Situation*, edited by Immanuel Wallerstein, John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1966.
- Belshaw, Cyril S., "The Significance of Modern Cults in Melanesian Development," *The Australian Outlook*, June 1950, pp. 116-125.
- Bondurant, Joan V. and Margaret W. Fisher, "The Concept of Change in Hindu, Socialist, and Neo-Gandhian Thought", in Donald Eugene Smith (editor), South Asian Politics and Religion, Princeton, New Jersey, Princeton University Press, 1966.
- Bonn, Gisela, "The Grim Buddha," Atlas, October 1965, pp. 207-210, translated from Christ Und Welt, Stuttgart.
- Brown, Leon Carl, "The Islamic Reformist Movement in North Africa," The Journal of Modern African Studies, Vol. 2, No. 1, 1964, pp. 55-63.
- Burridge, Kenelm, Mambu: A Melanesian Millennium, New York, Humanities Press, 1960.
- Cohn, Norman, "Medieval Millenarism: Its Bearing on The Comparative Study of Millenarian Movements," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.

- Cohn, Norman, The Pursuit of the Millennium, Essential Books Inc., Fairlawn, New Jersey, 1957.
- Duarte, Raymundo, "Un Movimiento Messianico No Interior De Bahia," Revista De Antropologia, Vol. 11, June-Dec. 1963, pp. 41-51.
- Dubois, Cora, *The* 1870 *Ghost Dance*, University of California Anthropological Records, No. 3, Berkeley, 1939.
- Edmonson, Munro S., Donald E. Thompson, Gustavo Correa and William Madsen *Nativism and Syncretism*, Publication 19, Middle American Research Institute, Tulane University, New Orleans, 1960.
- Eliade, Mircea, "'Cargo-Cults' and Cosmic Regeneration," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Fals Borda, Orlando, "The Role of Violence in the Break with Traditionalism: The Colombian Case," Paper presented to the Fifth World Congress of Sociology—1962 (Mimeographed).
- Fernandez, James W., "African Religious Movements—types and dynamics," *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, vol. 2, No. 4, 1964, pp. 531-549.
- Fernandez, James W., "Politics and Prophecy: African Religious Movements," *Practical Anthropology*, Vol. 12, No. 2, 1965, pp. 71-75.
- Fisher, Humphrey J., Ahmadiyyah: A Study in Contemporary Islam on The West African Coast, Oxford University Press, London, 1963.
- Gifford, Ann, "An Application of Weber's Concept of Charisma," Berkeley Publications in Society and Institutions, 1955, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 40-49.
- Guiart, J., "Cargo Cults and Political Evolution in Melanesia," Mankind, May 1951, Vol. 4, No. 6, pp. 227-229.
- Guiart, Jean and Peter Worsley, "La Repartition Des Mouvements Millenaristes En Melanesia," Archiv. Sociol. Relig., Vol. 5, 1958, Jan-June, pp. 38-46.
- Gusfield, Joseph R., "Tradition and Modernity: Misplaced Polarities in the Study of Social Change," American Journal of Sociology, Vol. 72, No. 4, Jan. 1967, pp. 351-362.
- Heimert, Alan, Religion and The American Mind: From the Great Awakening to the Revolution, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1966.
- Hobsbawm, E. J., Primitive Rebels: Studies in Archaic Forms of Social Movement in the 19th and 20th Centuries, Frederick A. Praeger, New York, 1963.
- Johnson, Chalmers, Revolutionary Change, Little, Brown and Co., Boston, 1966.
- Kaminsky, Howard, "The Problem of Explanation," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Knox, R. A., Enthusiasm: A Chapter in the History of Religion, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 1950.
- Koestler, Arthur, "Last of the Saints," Commentary, Vol. 29, Jan-June 1960, pp. 141-149.
- Krader, Lawrence, "A Nativistic Movement in Western Siberia," American Anthropologist, Vol. 58, 1956, pp. 282-292.
- Lanternari, Vittorio, The Religions of the Oppressed: A Study of Modern Messianic Cults, Alfred A. Knopf, New York, 1963.
- Linton, Ralph, "Nativistic Movements," American Anthropologist, Vol. 45, 1943, pp. 230-240.
- Marriott, McKim, "Cultural Policy in the New States," in Old Societies and New States, edited by Clifford Geertz, Free Press of Glencoe, New York, 1963.
- Moos, Felix, "Some Aspects of Park Chang No Kyo—A Korean Revitalization Movement," Anthropological Quarterly, Vol. 37, No. 3, July 1964, pp. 110-120.
- Plotnicov, Leonard, "Nativism in Contemporary Nigeria," Anthropological Quarterly, Vol. 37, No. 3, July 1964, pp. 121-137.
- Rahula, Walpola, What the Buddha Taught, Grove Press, New York 1959.
- Ribeiro, Rene, "Brazilian Messianic Movements," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and C., The Hague, 1962.
- Rotberg, R. I., "The Rise of African Nationalism: The Case of East and Central Africa," in Social Change: The Colonial Situation, edited by Immanuel Wallerstein, John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1966.

- Schlosser, K., Propheten in Afrika, Braunschweig, 1949.
- Shepperson, George "The Comparative Study of Millenarian Movements" in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Shepperson, George, "Nyasaland and the Millennium," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Simpson, George E., "The Ras Tafari Movement in Jamaica in its Millennial Aspect," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Siriwardane, C. D. S., "Buddhist Reorganization in Ceylon," in South Asian Politics and Religion, edited by Donald Eugene Smith, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1966.
- Smith, Donald Eugene, Religion and Politics in Burma, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1965.
- Smith, Donald Eugene, "The Sinhalese Buddhist Revolution," in South Asian Politics and Religion, edited by Donald Eugene Smith, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1966.
- Smith, Donald Eugene, "The Political Monks and Monastic Reform," in South Asian Politics and Religion, edited by Donald Eugene Smith, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1966.
- Stanner, W. E. H., The South Seas in Transition, Australian Publishing Co., London, 1953.
- Sundkler, Bengt G. M., Bantu Prophets in South Africa, Oxford University Press, London, 1961.
- Thrupp, Sylvia L., "Millennia! Dreams in Action; Report on the Conference Discussion," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Van der Kroef, Justus M., "Messianic Movements in the Celebes, Sumatra and Borneo," in Sylvia L. Thrupp (editor), Millennial Dreams in Action, Mouton and Co., The Hague, 1962.
- Voget, Fred W., "The American Indian in Transition: Reformation and Accommodation," American Anthropologist, Vol. 58, 1956, pp. 249-263.
- Von Grunebaum, G. E., "Problems of Muslim Nationalism," in Social Change: The Colonial Situation, edited by Immanuel Wallerstein, John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1966.
- Wallace, Anthony F. C., "Revitalization Movements," American Anthropologist, Vol. 58, 1956, pp. 264-281.
- Wallis, Wilson D., Messiahs: Their Role in Civilization, American Council on Public Affairs, Washington D. C., 1943.
- Wilson, A. Jeyaratnam, "Buddhism in Ceylon Politics, 1960-1965," in South Asian Politics and Religion, edited by Donald Eugene Smith, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1966.
- Worsley, Peter, The Third World, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1964.
- Worsley, Peter, The Trumpet Shall Sound: A Study of 'Cargo' Cults in Melanesia (Second, Augmented Edition), Schocken Books, New York, 1968.