A Critical Analysis of the Pāli Sutta Nipāta Illustrating Its Gradual Growth: General Observations and Conclusions

§ 1. IN the series of contributions to the *U.C.R.* concluding with the present article, an attempt has been made at an analysis of the Pāli Sutta Nipāta in the light of Higher Criticism. Various factors of the latter were grouped under the categories of ' criteria ' which enabled us to estimate the single suttas as well as groups of them from the angle of literary, doctrinal and linguistic development. Special attention was paid, in the application of these criteria, to view the Sutta Nipāta under the aspect of historical development. Wherever possible, external evidence was adduced in the historical interpretation of the data furnished by internal sources.

A study of methodology was one of the main concerns of this undertaking. Copious examples of each category have been given to illustrate and (as far as possible) prove the propositions ; and special attention has been paid to samples of textual interpretation. Exegesis was both synthetic and analytic and the foundation on which it was built is the historical background of Indian (Hindu and Brahmanic) ideas around and prior to the time of Asoka.

By ' growth ' is implied the gradual formation of a separate anthology called the Sutta Nipāta by the incorporation of suttas belonging to diverse strata.

For purposes of investigation this work has been divided into four parts. *Part I* (Introductory). The chief criteria (which fall under the heads of linguistic, metrical and literary evidence, doctrinal developments, growth of ideas and external and indirect evidence) employed in the examination of the ballads and other poems of the Sutta Nipāta were discussed in *U.C.R.*, VI, 1. The remarks in *U.C.R.*, VI, 2 are also of an introductory nature, dealing with the title ' Sutta Nipāta ' and its form and contents. *Part II*. A brief study of the five Vaggas of the Sutta Nipāta was made in *U.C.R.*, VI, 4. Special attention has been paid to explain the present arrangement of the suttas in their respective vaggas. A few topics of general importance such as the seven ' dhammapaliyāyas ' of Asoka's Bhabra Edict, the Chinese version of the Arthapadaṃ (Aṭṭhaka Vagga), the title ' Aṭṭhaka Vagga ' and the relation of the vatthugāthā to the pucchās of the Pārāyana were also discussed there. *Part III*. The contributions in *U.C.R.*, VII, 1 to IX, 1 dealt with the analysis of a few suttas representative of the various types of poems of the Sutta Nipāta, with the aid of the criteria detailed in *U.C.R.*, VI, 1. The poems examined were: three ballads from the Uraga Vagga, (Uraga, Khaggavisāna and Muni Suttas), five suttas,

113

of popular character (viz. Parābhava, Vasala, Maṅgala, Metta and Ratana), the Yakkha-ballads (Hemavata, Āḷavaka and Sūciloma Suttas), the Pastoral-ballads, Dhaniya and Kasibhāradvāja Suttas, the narrative-ballads, Pabbajjā, Padhāna and Nālaka Suttas, suttas from the Aṭṭhaka Vagga and the Pucchās of the Pārāyana. Now, *Part IV* is devoted for general observations and conclusions.

The composition of the majority of these poems can be assigned to the period 400-300 B.C. On the evidence available, it is clear that individual suttas have to be taken on their own merits though to some extent particular types of suttas can be vaguely generalised as belonging to distinct strata. The results which this investigation points to fall under the following headings :—(1) an early nucleus of a more or less floating tradition ; (2) several intermediate redactions incorporating suttas drawn from the Buddha-legend and Buddha-worship ; (3) a final redaction made for the purpose of propagating the Buddhist faith through its ecclesiastic representative, the Saṅgha.

§ 2. In the analysis of the suttas (*loc. cit.*), with the aid of the criteria detailed in *U.C.R.*, VI, 1 a few general tendencies have been observed. Many of the poems, on linguistic grounds, appear to be old; but it is not always that the evidence from other sources is in support of this. Generally speaking the poems of the Aṭṭhaka and Pārāyana Vaggas and many of the pieces of the Uraga Vagga, in addition to those poems which can be termed as the ' Muni-ballads ', represent the oldest stratum in the Sutta Nipāta. Before finally enumerating the results which this investigation has led to, a short synthesis of the various data will perhaps be helpful in obtaining a better perspective of the Sutta Nipāta as viewed from the angle of Higher Criticism. This synthesis will be mainly devoted to some aspects of linguistic data ; and the characteristics of the later compositions can be inferred thereby. No special attention will be paid to the nominal forms and the few remarks made in isolated instances on the vocabulary are deemed sufficient. Yet, some interesting nominal forms have been touched upon. On the other hand, a study of the verb and the verbal derivatives sheds further light on the Sutta Nipāta as a whole. However, dialectical variations, Vedic characteristics, style and metre will again be touched upon in passing. Sufficient has been said in the individual suttas taken up for analysis on the doctrinal developments; and comparisons with similar poems (in Sn.) and classes of ballads have to some extent shown the general trends in Sn. A short survey will be made of the epithets and other terms used in Sn. to describe the muni and the Buddha.

§ 3. The Sutta Nipāta is rich in verbal forms and shows a very wide range. There are over 2,364 finite verbs in Sn. leaving aside variant readings and p.p.p's. used in a finite sense. Of special interest are the verbs in the Optative and Imperative Moods and the Aorist and Future Tenses.

Optative.—The most favoured inflexion for the opt. in Sn. is -e for 3 sg. In all, about 192 forms end in -e, but as many as 31 of them are either causals or medials (of the 10th class) with the element -ay- (i.e. -aye); e.g. hāraye ; ādiye, cintaye, etc. A small number of these optatives in -e belongs to the first and second person singular ; e.g. sikkhe Sn. 1061a, 1062d, etc. Next in number come the forms in -eyya. Considering the fact that this is the most popular conjugational element for opt. in Pali, (*vide* Geiger, § 128) it is surprising to note that there are only 135 such forms. Geiger (*ibid.*) does not class these forms as very early, for -eyya is a generalization of the Sk. -eya which underwent universal application in Pali. Of the 135 forms, no less than 115 are 3 sg. Another inflexion used frequently is ā for 3rd sg. (Sk. -āt); 71 times. Its use however, is restricted to a few roots, e.g. $\sqrt{jñā}$, 33 times, $\sqrt{as}$, 27 times (assa and siyā), $\sqrt{kr}$ (kayirā) 7 times, etc. The opt. 3 sg. in -etha occurs 57 times, and the 2 sg. in -etho only once (Sn. 833c). Opt. 1 sg. in -aṃ occurs 6 times (vijaññaṃ, Sn. 482a, 1020d, 1022e, 1065b, 1090c, 1097d). The first pl. in -mu or -ma occurs 8 times (jānemu, Sn. 76d, 559f, 999ad, jāniyāma 873d, namassemu 995e, sikkhema, 89c and 32b v.l. carema-se). The 3rd pl. in -u or -uṃ (// Sk. -uḥ) occurs 10 times. It is evident that these forms are old. As seen above, some of the forms ending in -uṃ have also the element -eyy- which can be directly traced to Vedic (and Sk.) -ey. Besides those belonging to the type kathayeyya (Sn. 980d) which are accepted as old (Geiger § 139), the majority of the 135 forms in -eyy cannot be classed with the later types enumerated by Geiger (*ibid.*) viz. 1 sg. manteyyaṃ (Sn. p. 103), 2 sg. āroceyyāsi (M. II. 210), dhāreyyāsi (Milp. 47), 3 sg. jāleyya (M. II. 203) and dasseyya (Milp. 47).

Imperative.—The imp. in Sn. can be tabulated as follows :—

> 2 sg. in -a, 43 ; in -hi, 110 ; in -ssu, 23 ;
>
> 2 pl. in -tha, 40 ; in -vho, 3 ;
>
> 3 sg. in -tu, 16 ;
>
> 3 pl. in -ntu, 6.

All these forms are historical in varying degrees, but are used in all stages of the language, and therefore are of no great value.

Aorist.—Parasmaipada : Following Geiger's classification (Geiger, § 159) 37 verbs can be said to belong to type I (33, aor. 3 sg., 3, aor. 2 sg., 1, aor. 3 pl.), 63 to type II (40, aor. 3 sg., 2, aor. 2 sg., 5, aor. 1 sg., 13, aor. 3 pl., 3, aor. 1 pl.), 90 to type III (72, aor. 3 sg., 5, aor. 2 sg., 3, aor. 1 sg., 10, aor. 3 pl.) and 119 to type IV (67, aor. 3 sg., 5, aor. 2 sg., 7, aor. 1 sg., 38, aor. 3 pl., 2, aor. 1 pl.) which make a total of 309. Ātmanepada : There are 18 A'pada aor. forms. Of them 11 belong to type II (3 sg.), 4 to type II (1 sg.), 2 to type IV (3 sg.) and 1 to type IV (1 pl.)—*vide* Geiger, *ibid.* Among these forms are a few augmentless aorists. Some original pf. forms can still be distinguished,

e.g. āha, vedi, etc. The impf., lost in Pali, is represented by type II and the characteristics of the impf. are preserved in many of them.

Future Tense.—The sign of the future tense conjugation i-ssa- and the terminations -mi, -ma, -si, -tha, -ti, -nti are used in 46 future tense verbs. A form with issāmase occurs once (Sn. 814d). The future I. sg. -issaṃ occurs 9 times, and -ssaṃ (without the connecting vowel -i-) is used twice with thematic roots (upessaṃ Sn. 29c, and sossaṃ 494c). The other historical forms are :— anupadassati (dā-sya-ti, Sn. 983b), kāhasi (kār-ṣya-si, -ss- ▷ -h- 427d, 428d) gañchisi (*gamᵗsya- i/y, 665d), dakkhiti (drākṣyati, i/y, 909a), dakkhinti (p. 14), pavakkhāmi (-vakṣyāmi, 701c, 963d, 1050b), bhāsihi (bhās-ya- i/y, -analogical- 719a), sakkhinti (cp. dakkhinti 28c) and sagghasi (√śak, 834d). This brings a total of 72 future forms.

§ 4. The verbal derivatives too show an old phase of the language. The Agent Noun, Absolutive, Present Participle, and the Future Passive Participle will be discussed below. The Past Participle Passive will not be touched upon as it yields no definite information. The Infinitives and other forms of Vedic or dialectical origin will also be mentioned.

Agent Noun.—There are 21 agent nouns in Sn. distributed in the following manner in the five vaggas :—8, 1, 6, 4 and 2 respectively.

Absolutive (Gerund).—There are 389 absolutives in the whole of Sn. gāthās. Of them as many as 187 end in -ya, i.e. 111 formed with vowel-ending roots in Pali, in addition to 2 with -āya▷-ā (pariññā Sn. 779a, palikhaññā 968b), 66 with consonant-ending roots and assimilation, in addition to 3 with -yy- (pappuyya, Sn. 593b, 829d, 482d) and 7 forms with the svarabhakti vowel (a-r-i). Of these 187 forms, 185 contain prefixes conforming to the Sk. rules. The two forms without prefixes are :—gahāya Sn. 791d, and yāciya 295b. Of the others, there are 117 formed with -tvā, directly from the root. There are 8 forms with -tvā assimilated (labh + tvā > laddhā). There are 26 forms formed directly from the base. Of the 48 forms with -tvāna, 45 are formed directly from the root, two with the base and one form with assimilation (laddhāna Sn. 67c). The form daṭṭhu occurs 3 times (Sn. 424b, 681d, 1098b). Of these 202 as many as 36 forms contain prefixes. It is clear that the majority of these forms go back to a very early stratum in the language.

Present Participle.—In all, there are 350 present participial forms. Of them as many as 139 are medial (107 contain the suffix. māna and 32 -āna, both of which are highly archaic and go back to Vedic dialects). The occasional pronominal terminations of ppr. forms with -māna (e.g. Sn. 434a, and mānassa, 7 times) do not indicate that they were late, for in early Sk. too -smin and -sya are the terminations for the sg. of loc. and gen. respectively for ppr. medials in -māna. Of the rest of the 211 ppr. forms as many as 191 are historical. The total lack of forms like gacchantassa and gacchantaṃ and the

exclusive use of forms like gacchato and gacchataṃ for the gen. sg. and pl. respectively show that the ppr. too represents an old stage of the language. The 20 forms which cannot be considered equally old consist of 17 nom. singulars in -anto and 3 loc. singulars in -ante. But in Pali these endings came to be fixed for their respective cases rather early. Though they are not pure historical forms they may be old. The nom. sg. in -aṃ occurs 83 times as contrasted with that in -anto, 17 times. The nom. sg. -āno occurs 21 times (passives included) while that in -māno (passives included) occurs 67 times. The nom. sg. neut. -antaṃ occurs once (Sn. 208b jāyantaṃ). The nom. pl. in -antā occurs 13 times, in -mānā 12 times, and in -ānā 9 times. The gen. sg. in -ato occurs 44 times as contrasted with that in -antassa *nil* and in -mānassa 7 times. The gen. pl. -ataṃ is to be met with 20 times (tāṃ once, *metri causa*, Sn. 763d), as contrasted with -antānaṃ *nil*, and -mānānaṃ only once (Sn. 569c). The acc. sg. in -antaṃ occurs 24 times (including passives and one instance of the final nasal omitted *metri causa* -Sn. 689c) as against the acc. sg. in -mānaṃ 12 times and that in -ānaṃ twice (Sn. 789d, 802c). The acc. pl. in -ante is to be seen three times, that in -māne twice and neut. -mānāni once. The inst. sg. in -tā occurs twice (asatā Sn. 861b, 950c) and that in -tyā (fem.) once (santyā Sn. 872c). The loc. sg. in -ante and -māne occur three times each and in mānamhi once (Sn. 434a). The loc. pl. -mānesu is seen only once (Sn. 434c).

Future Passive Participle.—There are 63 f.p.p. forms in Sn.; of them 46 are formed with -ya (17 assimilated forms), 6 from -tabba and 11 from -anīya. A noteworthy feature is that 46 out of a total of 63 are formed with -ya. Speaking of Sk. the derivatives with -ya are formed in all periods of the language whereas the other two are of later origin—being almost entirely absent in the Vedas (Whitney § 962a). The same holds good with Pali.

The *infinitive* in -tuṃ is the commonest, but there is an appreciable number of Vedic forms in -tave. (Dative Infinitive) ; e.g. unnametave (Sn. 206b), dātave (Sn. 286d), vippahātave (Sn. 817d) and sampayātave (Sn. 843d).

Vedic and Dialectical Variations

§ 5. It is not only in the verb that Vedic and dialectical forms are preserved in Sn. Nominal themes too, both in their composition and declensional terminations show Vedic and dialectical characteristics. Many examples of such forms have been noted in the analysis of the suttas. To give a few more instances, the indicative 3 pl. (A'pada) in -re is seen to occur several times (*vide* Geiger, § 122. 2), e.g. upadissare (Sn. 140d), dissare (688d), patijānare (601b), pithiyyare (1034d, 1035d), miyyare (575b), vijjare (20a), and socare (445d). There are a few instances of the ending -āmase (1 pl.), e.g. carāmase (Sn. 32b), sikkhissāmase (814d). The Vedic -as has already been

noted in jaras (Sn. 804d, 1123b), also cp. lūkhasā (Sn. 244a) and damasā, besides forms like manasā which are in frequent use in Pali.

There are at least 22 *double Vedic forms* in Sn.; of them as many as 17 belong to the Aṭṭhaka and Pārāyana Vaggas; viz. cutāse (Sn. 774d), avītataṇhāse (776d, 901d), sitāse (791a), paṭicchitāse (803b), pañhavīmaṃsakāse (827b), paṇḍitāse (875d, 876b), pavādiyāse (885b), upaṭṭhitāse (898b), saṅkhatadhammāse (1038a), samaṇabrāhmaṇāse (1079a-1082a), anāsavāse (1082f, 1083f)—in the Aṭṭhaka and Pārāyana Vaggas—and samūhatāse (Sn. 14b, 369b), paccayāse (15b), upāsakāse (367d), samuppilavāso (670d); also cp. the sg. rakkhitamānasāno (63b).

Dialectical variations are too numerous to give a comprehensive list here. The Māgadhī nom. sg. has been noted earlier. Besides this, various other forms belonging to dialectical strata have been pointed out. However, the following words are of special interest not only for the study of the Sutta Nipāta, but of the whole Canon. The Sutta Nipāta preserves many forms the parallels of which are to be found either in Sn. itself or elsewhere in the Canon. The word akalya occurs at Sn. 692a, (akalyarūpo, 691b) besides akalla at 456d; but in the case of tulya 377c, 85b, 683b there is no parallel form tulla in Sn. (cp. J. IV, 102), whereas tuliya occurs frequently in the Canon (s.v. P.T.S.). Such combinations of semi-vowels do not present a standard form in Pali (*vide* Geiger, § 54). cp. also -annaya (Sn. 243c) and -anvaya (Sn. 36b, 254a, 556b). The forms aggi, aggini and gini have been noted earlier. The form aggi occurs at least 8 times in Sn. in addition to the proper name Aggikabhāradvāja; aggini, 3 times (Sn. 668d, 670bd) and gini twice (Sn. 18c, 19c). The parallel observed (*loc. cit.*) was atta, ātuma, and tuma; atta occurs at least 45 times leaving aside cpds., ātuma, 3 times (Sn. 782d, 888b, 918d), and tuma twice (Sn. 890b, 908c). Substitution of consonants is to be noted in anītika (3 times) by the side of anītiha (also 3 times). The parallel form abhikkhaṇaṃ to abhiṇhaṃ (7 times in Sn.) is not to be met with in Sn. cp. tiṇha 3 times, but tikhiṇa and tikkha do not occur; also cp. timisa Sn. 669c. Similarly, aṅga does not occur though iṅgha is found 5 times. The particle iva (usually after original h, m, or inorganic r, m, or in combination with a + i ≥ e—sseva only—occurs 37 times, whereas va occurs 58 times (7 times after -ā 4 after -ī 3 after -e, 20 after -o and 24 after -m). But the later Pali form viya occurs only 5 times in the whole of Sn. The form chamā occurs at Sn. 401b, but samā the rarer form does not occur. Other parallel forms of interest are, iha at Sn. 460a (in tasmāt iha) as opposed to idha, over 90 times; uju and ujuṃ once each as opposed to ujju—7 times; ubho, the original dual 8 times as against ubhaya 5 times; eva 61 times as opposed to va 23 times (mainly *metri causa*) while yeva is seen 4 times; kasira and kiccha both occur once each (Sn. 574c, 676a); kukkuciya occurs once (Sn. 972d) and

kukkucca twice (Sn. 925b, 1106d); agiha occurs 4 times, gihī at least 6 times, gaha (cp. Rajagaha, 408a) in gahaṭṭha, 9 times, geha (nissita) at Sn. 280b and ghara 6 times; taccha occurs at Sn. 327d and 1096d, while tathiya at Sn. 883a and 368c; tatra occurs 4 times as opposed to tattha about 40 times; tamanudo is found at Sn. 1136a besides tamonudo at 1133a; thiyo at Sn. 796c has been noted earlier, and itthi occurs at Sn. 112a; divya occurs twice and dibba 4 times (cp. kalya); dhañña is seen 4 times as against dhāniya twice; usabha occurs 5 times whereas asabha occurs thrice in cpds.; the form nariyo (3 times) is probably a metrical variation of nāriyo and nāriṃ occurs at Sn. 836b; nahātaka is found at Sn. 646c whereas nhā- is seen at Sn. 518b, and 521d; pāda occurs 14 times (inclusive of cpds.) while pada 17 times (cp. padā and pādā); the form bhiyyo (11 times) is preferred to -bhuyyas (only once in prose); the forms sacchi- and sakkhi- have been discussed earlier; Sakka occurs 6 times, Sakya 10 times and Sākiya, twice; sāmin and suvāmin occur once each (Sn. 83b, 666b). The group sva- has been dealt with earlier.

§6. Sufficient has been said on the style of the suttas in general, as well as that of the individual suttas taken up for discussion in Part III. The general inference made earlier is that a more ornate and ' finished ' style is an indication of lateness in composition. The table of alliteration and assonance in the gāthās given by Mr. Hare (*Woven Cadences*, pp. 220 ff.) and his list of śleṣas (*ibid*. pp. 218 ff.) clearly show that these poetic devices are employed most in the pieces which cannot be stated to be the oldest sections of Sn. On the other hand, onomatopoeia is not restricted to any one type of composition, yet it is apparently less in the earlier ones. Metre has been dwelt on at length in *U.C.R.*, VI, 1. The excellent analysis of the metres of Sn. by Helmer Smith (SnA. pp. 637 ff.) is a useful guide for the interpretation of the metres of Sn.

The *doctrinal trends* point to the realization of attha; the overcoming of birth, of misery (' Ill '), and of notions of self (mamāyita); the ascetic life and the Way Beyond are all attendant on the realization of this *summum bonum*. A comprehensive study of this aspect of Sn. has been made by scholars and it is not proposed to discuss it any further. (*Vide* Chalmers, Fausböll, Hare and Katre).

§7. The terms and epithets used in Sn. usually reflect an old phase. The following synthesis will be mainly restricted to the gāthās. The term muni is used 77 times in the gāthās. It is distributed in the five vaggas in the following manner: 26, 2, 17, 18 and 14. In 24 instances it is an epithet of the Buddha. It is significant that 8 of the 17 references in Mahā Vagga are to the Buddha, and a noteworthy feature is that the least references to muni are in the two vaggas which are not the oldest sections in Sn. (i.e. 2 in Culla Vagga and 9—excluding the 8 references to the Buddha—in Mahā

Vagga). Besides these, mona occurs at Sn. 718c, 723cd, moneyya at Sn. 484c, 698c, 700d, 701a, 716a and monapatha at Sn. 540c. Bhikkhu occurs 80 times in the gāthās, i.e. 22, 19, 15, 18 and 6 times respectively in the five vaggas in addition to over 15 times in the prose. Just as the term muni occurs a large number of times in Muni Sutta (18), bhikkhu is frequently used in the Uraga, Tuvaṭaka and Sammāparibbajaniya Suttas (17, 9, and 8 times respectively). The term sāvaka occurs only 12 times, and it is significant that it is not used in the Aṭṭhaka and Pārāyana Vaggas. Besides, these references are to be found in suttas which cannot be called particularly old. Five of these references are in the Dhammika Sutta, in which bhikkhu occurs 8 times but muni not once. Samaṇa occurs 31 times in the gāthās, and over 10 times in the prose (7, 1, 11, 8 and 4 respectively in the five vaggas). It is used in a wider sense than a Buddhist samaṇa in at least 17 out of the 31 occurrences. In the combined phrase, samaṇabrāhmaṇa it occurs 7 times in verse and once in prose. It is again curious to note that the word occurs only once in the Culla Vagga. The word brāhmaṇa occurs 141 times in verse and 12 times in prose (12, 16, 82, 8 and 23 times respectively in the five vaggas). The extra-ordinarily large number of references in the Mahā Vagga is due to the fact that it deals mainly with brahmin interlocutors; and in the Pārāyana, the majority of the references are in the vatthu-gāthā. Brahma occurs 43 times in the gāthās and 7 times in prose; i.e. brahma (Sk. brāhma) once, Brahmā 6 times, as an appellative (voc. brahme) 3 times, and the rest in cpds. including brahma-cariyā 19 times in gāthā and 9 other references connected with brahma-cariyā in both prose and verse. Brahma-loka is mentioned 6 times. There are only 3 references in the Uraga Vagga and one in Aṭṭhaka Vagga. Thera occurs only twice, and both in prose (discussed earlier). The word saṅgha occurs only 7 times apart from the 8 references in Ratana Sutta. It refers to the Saṅgha (apart from Ratana S.) probably only at Sn. 569d, 1015b (Pār. v.g.) and p. 16 (prose). The term Buddha occurs 39 times in the gāthās (i.e. 10, 5, 14, 1 and 9 times respectively in the five vaggas). Of these the personal Buddha is referred to 7, 3, 5, 1 and 9 times respectively in the five vaggas. All the references in the first three vaggas go with other epithets while the 9 references in the Pārāyana are to be found in the v.g. and epilogue. Bodhisatta occurs only once in the late vatthu-gāthā of the Nālaka Sutta. Sambodhi occurs 5 times. Sambuddha occurs 3 times in Uraga Vagga, 7 times in the Mahā Vagga and 9 times in the v.g. and epilogue of the Pārāyana. Bhagavā occurs 54 times in the gāthās and over 20 times in the prose. It does not occur in the Aṭṭhaka Vagga. Satthā occurs 12 times in verse and Sugato 4 times while each epithet is used at least twice in prose. Tathāgata occurs 21 times in both prose and verse; but it does not occur in the gāthās of the Uraga and Aṭṭhaka Vaggas.

In all the above instances it is quite clear that the early emphasis is on the muni or the bhikkhu and not on the saṅgha or the 'perfect' disciple nor on the personality of the Buddha. These aspects are taken up by the later poems.

§ 8. Coming to a few terms of general interest atta, dhamma, attha, saddhā, patha, magga, nibbāna and saṃsāra (bhava, etc.) demand attention The words atta (by itself and in cpds.) ātuma and tuma occur 105 times in the gāthās (i.e. 11, 14, 44, 29 and 7 times respectively in the five vaggas). Anatta has already been referred to. Atta meaning body or soul in the Brahmanic sense is found at Sn. 508b (Māgha's words), and 919a (a denial) and 800a (a doubtful context); atta (self) tending towards the Brahmanic concept is found at Sn. 514a and 709a; attānaṃ, the reflexive in objective case in 10 instances (and probably also at Sn. 709a). The possessive of the (pronominal) reflexive occurs in 13 instances, the reflexive agent attanā in 5 and the loc. of the reflexive attani in 3 instances and the ethic dative at Sn. 368a. All the three occurrences of ātumānaṃ appear to be reflexives (Sn. 782a, 888b, 918d). Ma-matta (or mamāyita) occurs 12 times in the gāthās; 9 of these references are in the Aṭṭhaka Vagga. Amama also occurs 5 times. The word dhamma occurs 188 times in diverse meanings. Attha occurs 48 times in Sn. The significant references are Sn. 190d, 453c, 326c, 324d, 176a, 219a, 191c, 323c, 37b, 126a, 159d, and 320b. Saddhā occurs 16 times, but there is not a single reference to it in the Aṭṭhaka Vagga and the Pucchās. The words patha, magga and yāna have been discussed earlier. Nibbāna by itself and in cpds. occurs 15 times in Sn. The references are equally distributed in the five vaggas. There are 5 references to saṃsāra in the Mahā Vagga and bhava occurs 23 times in the gāthās (i.e. 6, 2, 5, 8 and 2 times respectively in the five vaggas) in addition to bhavābhavataṃ at Sn. 6b, itthabhāvaññathābhā-vaṃ, 3 instances, vitathaṃ 9b-13b and vinābhāva at 588c, and 805c.

Conclusions

§ 9. As regards definite results which this investigation has yielded, one is confronted with various difficulties. Firstly, the diversity and disparity of the constituent parts of Sn. lead to contradictory data which result in conflicting conclusions. Secondly, the various religious elements which are not clearly separable rather tend to confuse the issue and are not helpful in any way in deciding the diverse strata these poems belong to. To give an example, the Buddha is referred to in many ways; Tathāgata, Gotama, Sakya and Buddha. Though these terms are interlinked there is an inherent subtle distinction as seen in phrases such as, Tathāgata-sāvaka, Gotama-sāsana, Samaṇa Gotama and Buddha-vacana. Thirdly, the archaic character of the language is sometimes very deceptive. It is not always that poems bearing an archaic stamp, linguistically, are genuinely old. This fact has been

stressed before and instances of this nature have already been noted ; (e.g. Ratana Sutta). The Pali of the gāthās represents the standard vehicle of poetic expression, the archaic colouring being the outcome of a close adherence to what may be termed as the gāthā-style. Yet, the Vedic elements in Sn., as a rule, are generally confined to those sections to which an early date can be assigned on *collective data*. On the other hand, the late linguistic characteristics have yielded definite information. Finally, no definite and precise information can be gathered from the haphazard arrangement of the suttas in Sn., for, no final decision can be made from the present state of Sutta Nipāta which contains suttas put together at various dates and presenting no uniformity whatsoever. The different traditions in Pali and BSk. show that the development of these suttas is many-sided with divergent roots both in contents and form.

§ 10. In spite of these limitations the diverse strata as regards compilation as opposed to those of composition are discernible to some extent in the light of the information gathered in the course of our investigation. It is not our aim to determine the dates of composition of every Sutta. The internal and external evidence of the suttas selected for analysis in Part III has shown that the suttas of the Aṭṭhaka Vagga, the Pucchās of the Pārāyana and the ballads in praise of the Muni-ideal (found chiefly in the Uraga Vagga) are about the oldest sections in Sn. The general didactic poems found scattered in the first three vaggas and usually named after a simile or metaphor represent a subsequent phase. To the same period can be assigned the two opening suttas of the Mahā Vagga dealing with the Buddha's early career, the older dialogues in the Mahā Vagga, the dialogue-ballads of the Uraga Vagga and the Yakkha-ballads. Four of the five suttas of popular character (i.e. excluding Ratana *U.C.R.*, VII, 4), the Cunda Sutta and the Kokāliya Suttas appear to be a little younger but were definitely pre-Asokan. The Ratana, Vijaya, and Dvayatānupassanā were probably the youngest suttas in Sn. while the vatthu-gāthās (excepting those of the Rāhula Sutta) represent the latest compositions in Sn.

S. N. Katre in his *Early Buddhist Ballads and their Relation to the older Upanishadic Literature* assigns the period 500-300 B.C. to the ballads of Sn. From the data now available and the fact that due allowance should be made for the arising of Buddhistic literary activity among the adherents of Buddhism (for, the pieces in Sn. are decidedly literary compositions) the age of composition of the bulk of the poems may be narrowed down roughly to the period 400-300 B.C. This does not deny the possibility of a few ballads being anterior to the earliest limit of 400 B.C. Although it is not possible to estimate by what length of time the various classes of poems were separated it is evident that the earliest and the youngest poems show a great disparity as regards their respective ages of composition. On the evidence available it is clear that

individual suttas have to be taken on their own merits, though to some extent particular types of suttas have been vaguely generalised as belonging to distinct strata.

§ 11. This disparity in the dates of composition of respective suttas clearly implies a 'growth'. The stages by which the present anthology has come into existence underlie the various strata in Sn. Firstly, there appears to have been an early nucleus of a more or less floating material quite similar to the traditional Brahmanic knowledge of pre-Buddhistic and early Buddhistic times on which were based the subsequent Dharma Śāstras and the early didactic literature of the Hindus. It is not only in thought and ideology that these early ballads of the Buddhists bear kinship with early Brahmanic literature (*vide* Katre) but also in phraseology and literary modes, all of which reflect a common background. This is not confined to the so-called 'unsectarian' ballads of Sn. which deal with general Indian or 'Āryan' teachings (embracing the ethical principles of Brahmanic teachings and Upaniṣadic lore) but is much in evidence even in poems which are considered as being distinctively Buddhistic.

The earliest attempt at a collection as such belongs to a subsequent period. Many of the poems in the Aṭṭhaka Vagga and the Pucchās of the Pārāyana are of a sectarian character on a broad basis. Although the general outlook of these poems is rather wide there is something characteristically Buddhist underlying them, as contrasted with poems of common Brahmanic and Buddhist origin. There is no doubt that the Aṭṭhaka and Pārāyana Vaggas and the Khaggavisāṇa Sutta formed the foundation on which this collection of suttas was built. In doing so the compilers have drawn freely from a floating tradition.

The transitional stage (or stages) of the formation of a nipāta was (or were) marked by the incorporation of these suttas as well as many others deemed as being truly representative of the Buddha's teaching. No definite conclusions can be arrived at regarding these intermediate stages. The present arrangement of the suttas in the Uraga Vagga (with the Khaggavisāṇa Sutta occupying the third place in it) shows a certain amount of re-shuffling to furnish a more effective presentation of the suttas ; for, Uraga with all the mysterious significance attached to it was probably considered as a suitable sutta to be placed at the head of the anthology.

As noted earlier (*U.C.R.*, VI, 2), the Uraga Vagga appears to be older than the next two vaggas. In view of the internal changes that have taken place in the various vaggas (*ibid.*) it is quite clear that the final redaction of Sn. has been preceded by several intermediate redactions (though they cannot be easily enumerated). The Culla Vagga and the Mahā Vagga have not come into their present form by any historical sequence. As suggested earlier

(*loc. cit.*), the two vaggas (perhaps together with Uraga) probably replaced an older group (or vagga) which contained suttas of popular appeal. The final phase was marked by the prefixing of Uraga, Ratana and Pabbajjā (and Padhāna) Suttas to the three respective vaggas under the editorial hand of monastic redactors for the purpose of propagating the Dhamma.

§ 12. Thus, the results of this investigation can be briefly summarised under the two heads (*a*) tradition and (*b*) growth :—

Sets of suttas with reference to tradition :

1. Unsectarian :
   (*a*) General Indian, 'Āryan' or Brahmanic (Upaniṣadic) teachings;
   (*b*) The ascetic ideal.
2. Sectarian ('Buddhist'):
   (*a*) Suttas purporting the Buddhist point of view;
   (*b*) Suttas with special Buddhist interpretations of then-current themes, values and concepts ;
   (*c*) Buddhist Dogmatics ; and Suttas representative of the ecclesiastical phase.
3. Popular Buddhism ; Suttas of the Life of the Buddha, and legend.

The main trends of growth :

1. An early nucleus of more or less floating material.
2. Several intermediate redactions incorporating suttas of popular Buddhism, dialogues, Buddhist ethics, life of Buddha and Buddhist worship.
3. A final redaction made for the purpose of propagating the Buddhist faith through its ecclesiastic representative, the Saṅgha.

(*Concluded*).

N. A. JAYAWICKRAMA